***Annex No. 3***

# The External Evaluation Report of a Doctoral Study Domain
# Member of the Evaluation Expert Commission/
# International Evaluator
# Prof. Eleonora Mihaylova Mileva, D.Sc., Ph.D.
# National Sports Academy "Vassil Levski", Sofia, Bulgaria

Contents

I. Introduction
II. Methods used
III. Analysis of performance indicators
IV. SWOT Analysis
V. Overview of judgments awarded and of the recommendations
VI. Conclusions and general recommendations

## I. Introduction[1]

This external evaluation report was drafted for Periodical External Evaluation of the IOSUD/doctoral study domains of Sports Science and Physical Education at Transilvania University of Braşov (UNITBV). The period of the evaluation visit was 8.11.2021 - 12.11.2021.

Transilvania University of Braşov (UNITBV) organizes doctoral and post-doctoral studies within the Organizing Institution of Doctoral University Studies - Transilvania University of Braşov.

The Interdisciplinary Doctoral School (SDI) has been operational within IOSUD-UNITBV since the 1st of October 2010, having been established by the Decision of the Senate of Transilvania University of Braşov of July 27, 2010. Previously, according to GD 567/15 June 2005, the Senate Office of Transilvania University of Braşov decided (HBS no. 43 / 09.09.2005) the establishment of the Doctoral Department on 9 September, 2005. The basic mission of this department was to coordinate all doctoral activities at the university.

There are 18 active doctoral fields, which fall into 6 fundamental fields and 11 branches of science.

The Interdisciplinary Doctoral School (SDI) is an intra-institutional structure of Transilvania University of Brasov, which is not only constituted as a distinct entity, but its operation is determined by the university's overall policy, contributing effectively, actively and efficiently to the achivement of this policy. Integrated in the structure of the Vice-Rectorate for scientific research and informatization (https://www.unitbv.ro/despreunitbv/informatii-de-interes-public/organigrama.html), and working according to the UNITBV current strategy, SDI is one of the three important pillars on which university research is grounded.

[1] Each time when applicable the information shall be presented gender-wise.

## II. Methods used

This chapter will contain the methods and tools used in the external evaluation process, before and during the evaluation visit.

• The analysis of the internal evaluation report of the doctoral study domain under review and its Annexes

The internal evaluation report of the doctoral study domain at the Transilvania University of Braşov (UNITBV) under review is comprehensive and accurately and thoroughly reflects all mandatory criteria and indicators for specific activities.

• The analysis of documents, data and information available on the IOSUD/Doctoral School(s) website, in electronic format

All necessary documents, data and information for the assessment of the doctor's domain are presented. The website of the doctoral school is detailed and informative.

• Visiting the buildings included in the institution's property, comprising (indicative and non-exhaustive list, which shall be changed according to the context)

As a member of the expert evaluation committee, I did not participate in an on-site visit to the institution's property, base, classrooms and facilities.

• Meeting with the contact person for the doctoral study domain under review and the team responsible for the internal evaluation report

The meeting was focused on the main activities of the doctoral school, the conditions of study, the opportunities for scientific activity.

• Meeting/discussions with doctoral students in the doctoral study domain under review

Students from the doctoral school in Sports Science and PE at UNITBV from different training courses were present. All students expressed their satisfaction with their studies in the doctoral school, giving high evaluation of the supervisiors.

• Meeting/Discussions with the graduates of the doctoral study domain under review

A separate online meeting was organized with the graduates of the doctoral school in Sports Science and PE at UNITBV. Attendees had graduated in various specialties and work in various fields of physical education and sports. All graduates expressed their positive attitude towards the training and the teachers advisors from the doctoral school.

• Meeting/Discussions with the teaching staff in the doctoral study domain under review

The teaching staff from the doctoral school focused on the content of the education and the financial provision, the access of the students to laboratories and research activities from the side of the University, and student participation in research projects and publication in scientific journals.

• Meeting/Discussions with the employers

The employers expressed their satisfaction with the work of the graduates of the doctoral school. Opportunities for joint activities and events were discussed.

• Meeting/Discussions with the the Commission for Quality Evaluation and Assurance (CEAC) members

In doctoral schools at university level, a strict system for the quality of education has been developed according to certain criteria and indicators.

• Meeting/Discussions with the Directors/ persons in charge of the research centers/laboratories within the doctoral study domain

There was a discussion about the equipment and the main devises at the the research centers/ laboratory of the doctoral school in Sport Science and PE and their use in the field of physical education and sports.

## III. Analysis of ARACIS's performance indicators

## *Domain A. INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITY*

### Criterion A.1. The administrative, managerial institutional structures and the financial resources

*The UNITBV has all the necessary administrative, management structures and financial support for conducting the training in the doctoral school.*

*Standard A.1.1. The institution organizing doctoral studies (IOSUD) has implemented the effective functioning mechanisms provided for in the specific legislation on the organization of doctoral studies.*

*The effective functioning mechanisms are provided for in the specific legislation on the organization of doctoral studies*

***Performance Indicator A.1.1.1.*** *The existence of specific regulations and their application at the level of the Doctoral School of the respective university doctoral study domain:*

*(a) the internal regulations of the Doctoral School;*

Transilvania University of Braşov (UniTBv) organizes doctoral studies within the Organizing Institution of Doctoral University Studies - Transilvania University of Braşov (IOSUD-UniTBv). The doctoral university studies are organized and carried out in accordance with the Regulation on the organization and development of doctoral and post-doctoral university studies (Appendix A.1.1.1-1), the variant in force at the time of evaluation being approved by Senate Decision no. 27 from 11/21/2018. The doctoral university study programs are organized and carried out within IOSUD-UniTBv through the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School (SDI). The organization and functioning of SDI, as well as the principles of organization, development and completion of doctoral studies in IOSUD-UniTBv, are established by the Regulation of the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School (Appendix A.1.1.1-2), the variant in force at the time of evaluation, approved by Senate Decision no. 14 of 19.07.2017, being available for consultation on the IOSUD-UniTBv website (https://www.unitbv.ro/documente/despre- unitbv/regulamente-hotarari/regulamenteleuniversitatii/ studenti/Regulament_ul_scolii_doctorale_19.07.2017.pdf). Prior to the approval by the University Senate, the SDI Regulation was approved by the vote of the doctoral supervisors within SDI, the process being organized in compliance with the legal provisions in force, and was approved by the Council for Doctoral Studies by CSUD Decision no. 18 from 31.05.2017.

*(b) the Methodology for conducting elections for the position of director of the Council of doctoral school (CSD), as well as elections by the students of their representative in CSD and the evidence of their conduct;*

In IOSUD-UniTBv, the director of the Council of the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School (C-SDI) is appointed in compliance with the provisions of Art. 14 par. (9) of the Code of Doctoral Studies, approved by GD 681/2011, according to which "The doctoral school council is

chaired by the director of the doctoral school who is appointed by CSUD from among the doctoral supervisors within the doctoral school and is a member of right in the Doctoral School Council ". For the current term (2016 - 2021), the director of C-SDI in office was appointed by CSUD-UniTBv by Decision no. 1/ 13.05.2016 (https://www.unitbv.ro/documente/cercetare/doctorat-postdoctorat/hotarari csud/Hotararea%20nr_1.pdf).

The other members of C-SDI, doctoral supervisors and doctoral students, respectively, are elected based on the Methodology on electing the members of the Council of the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School (Appendix A.1.1.1-3), which was developed by CSUD, according to the legal provisions in force. For the 2016-2021 mandate, the methodology was adopted by CSUD Decision no. 3 of 27.05.2016 and was approved by the University Senate by Decision no. 5 from 6.07.2016. Subsequently, the methodology was revised in order to organize by-elections by CSUD Decision no. 53 of 4.02.2019 and respectively the Senate Decision no. 30 of 14.02.2019, being available for consultation on the UniTBv website.

*c) the Methodologies for organizing and conducting doctoral studies (for the admission of doctoral students, for the completion of doctoral studies);*

The methodology for admission to the doctorate is elaborated annually, for each admission session. For the academic year 2021-2022, the admission methodology (Appendix A.1.1.1-5) was proposed by C-SDI, endorsed by CSUD by Decision no. 92 of 30.03.2021 and approved by the Senate by Decision no. 18 of 21.04.2021, being available for consultation on the IOSUD-UniTBv website.

*d) the existence of mechanisms for recognizing the status of a Doctoral advisor and the equivalence of the doctoral degree obtained abroad;*

The methodology regarding the automatic recognition in the Transilvania University of Braşov of the quality of doctoral supervisor or the qualification obtained in foreign accredited university educational institutions (Appendix A1.1.1-7) and the Methodology regarding the recognition in the Transilvania University of Braşov of the doctoral degree and the title of doctor in sciences or in a professional field, obtained abroad (Appendix A.1.1.1-8) were elaborated based Doctoral field *Sports Science and Physical Education* on the MENCS Order no. 5921/2016, being adopted by CSUD Decision no. 14 of 23.01.2017 and approved by the Decision of the University Senate no. 10 from 15.02.2017.

*e) functional management structures (Council of the doctoral school), giving as well proof of the regularity of meetings;*

The management structures of IOSUD-UniTBv and the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School operate on the basis of the Regulation on the organization and development of doctoral and postdoctoral studies, being constituted according to the legal provisions in force. The current mandate of CSUD corresponds to the period 2020-2024 (4 years), while the mandate of C-SDI in office is for the period 2016-2021 (5 years).

*f) the contract for doctoral studies;*

The doctoral university contract (Appendix A.1.1.1-10) contains the rights and obligations of doctoral students, doctoral supervisors, as well as IOSUD-UniTBv through SDI. The contract is concluded with each doctoral student separately, for the entire duration of the doctoral student's training and includes the clauses specified in the Code of doctoral studies. The model of the framework contract for doctoral university studies is elaborated by C-SDI and endorsed by CSUD. For the academic year in progress at the time of evaluation (2020-2021), the doctoral studies contract was approved by CSUD by Decision no. 71 from 23.03.2020.

*g) internal procedures for the analysis and approval of proposals regarding the training for doctoral study programs based on advanced academic studies.*

The way in which the analysis and approval of the proposals on the subject of the training program based on advanced university studies (PPUA) is carried out and regulated by Instruction IS-7 of the Regulation of the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School (Appendix A.1.1.1-12). The instruction refers to the specific stages and the decision-making mechanism regarding the opportunity to modify - periodically update the structure and content of the advanced university training program. C-SDI annually analyzes the content/structure of the PPUA and its relevance in the training of doctoral students, in order to ensure the required competencies.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator A.1.1.2.*** *The doctoral school' Regulation includes mandatory criteria, procedures and standards binding on the aspects specified in Article 17, paragraph (5) of the Government Decision No. 681/2011 on the approval of the Code of Doctoral Studies with subsequent amendments and additions.*

In IOSUD-UniTBv, the requirements indicated in Art. 17 par. (5) of the Code of doctoral studies are regulated by a package of specific instructions, developed by C-SDI and approved by CSUD, which are included in the annex to the Regulations of the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School, approved by the Decision of the University Senate no. 14 from 19.07.2017. The package of instructions was initially approved by the CSUD together with the SDI Regulation (CSUD Decision no. 18 of 31.05.2017), part of the instructions being subsequently revised (CSUD decisions approving the current versions of the revised instructions are indicated in the What's next). The instructions from the SDI Regulation are included in the quality management system at the Transilvania University of Brașov, being available on the IOSUD-UniTBv website.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

*Standard A.1.2. The IOSUD has the logistical resources necessary to carry out the doctoral studies' mission.*

*The necessary logistical resources have been created for the effective conduct of training in the doctoral school.*

***Performance Indicator A.1.2.1.*** *The existence and effectiveness of an appropriate IT system to keep track of doctoral students and their academic background.*

Within the Doctoral School, starting with 2005, the electronic record of the PhD students and their academic course, is made through databases by years of enrollment, made in Excel. Each excel database (file), corresponding to one year of enrollment, comprises in separate sheets, generically named, the candidates registered for admission, the admitted candidates, the enrolled doctoral students, the marks obtained within Doctoral field Sports Science and Physical Education, the PPUA, the doctoral students in internship, the thesis defenses, expelled doctoral students. The last 3 lists (PhD students in internship, thesis presentations, expatriates) are dynamic and result in time from the list of enrolled PhD students, depending on their course.

The doctoral internship sheet highlights and updates the course of PhD students, being recorded the following information: support of scientific research reports, interruptions of studies, extensions or

periods of grace; tax reductions or exemptions, changes in the form of funding, as well as other changes that may occur during the doctoral period (eg change of doctoral supervisor, thesis title, changes in the composition of the steering committee, etc.).

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator A.1.2.2.*** *The existence and use of an appropriate software program and evidence of its use to verify the percentage of similarity in all doctoral theses.*

Within IOSUD UTBv, respectively in the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School (SDI), was implemented, starting with July 2016, the verification of the originality of all doctoral theses entered in the finalization procedure through a specialized service of electronic comparison of documents and identification of the degree of similarity of compared to other sources, using successively over time two online software applications, among those recognized by CNATDCU (according to OMEC 3485/2016 and later OMEC 5229/2020 /Appendix II), namely:

- Sistemantiplagiat.ro (https://sistemantiplagiat.ro/) - during July 2016 - June 2019
- Turnitin software (https://www.turnitin.com/) accessible through the university's e-learning platform (https://elearning.unitbv.ro/) - from July 2019 until now.

The provisions of these regulations have been transposed in the specific Instruction IS-8- on the completion and public presentation of doctoral theses.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

*Standard A.1.3. The IOSUD makes sure that financial resources are used optimally, and the revenues obtained from doctoral studies are supplemented through additional funding besides governmental funding.*

*The university relies on additional funds and support to finance doctoral students, outside the state budget.*

***Performance Indicator A.1.3.1.*** *Existence of at least one research or institutional / human resources development grant under implementation at the time of submission of the internal evaluation file, per doctoral study domain under evaluation, or existence of at least 2 research or institutional development / human resources grant for the doctoral study domain, obtained by doctoral thesis advisors operating in the evaluated domain within the past 5 years. The grants address relevant themes for the respective domain and, as a rule, are engaging doctoral students.*

During the evaluated period, 3 international research grants were implemented ("Move and Jump" - international contract between FRSB and OMV for a period of 10 years, 2007-2017; EQuiPPE: Enhancing Quality in Primary Physical Education (Erasmus +, Cooperation for innovation and the exchange of good practices, Strategic Partnerships; Teaching Awareness of Ethical Governance in Sport), in which two of the PhD supervisors are members of the research teams (Balint Lorand, Bădău Dana) (Appendix A.1.3.1-1).

Regarding the participation of PhD students in research projects, they were of institutional development and promotion, so in the competition "We develop the university" (2019), PhD students Drugău Sorin, Pelin Bogdan and Olteanu Mircea, together with the teachers of the Faculty, won with the project "Fitness at UniTBv" the financing for the development of a fitness room with access for all the university staff, respectively of some programs that are supported by students (Appendix A.1.3.1-2). In

the direction of institutional promotion, the PhD student Pelin Bogdan, obtained national funding for the National University Ski & Snowboard Championships (Appendix A.1.3.1-3). In 2021, PhD students Pelin Bogdan and Ionescu Anca, together with the Faculty, obtained a research contract entitled "Efficiency of the sports training process for the women's basketball team of the ACS Ralph club" (Appendix A.1.3.1-4).

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator *A.1.3.2.*** *The percentage of doctoral students active at the time of the evaluation, who for at least six months receive additional funding sources besides government funding, through scholarships awarded by individual persons or by legal entities, or who are financially supported through research or institutional /human resources development grants is not less than 20%.*

From the data presented, within the field of Sports Science and Physical Education, indicator A.1.3.2. shows a percentage of 27.27% compared to 20% requested.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator *A.1.3.3.***[2] *At least 10% of the total amount of doctoral grants obtained by the university through institutional contracts and of tuition fees collected from the doctoral students enrolled in the paid tuition system is used to reimburse professional training expenses of doctoral students (attending conferences, summer schools, training, programs abroad, publication of specialty papers or other specific forms of dissemination etc.).*

In the calculation of the professional training expenses of the PhD students were considered expenses for internal and external mobility, publication fees and participation in conferences, summer schools, training internships, scholarships granted from own income, to which were added the mobility research (from the scholarship fund).

At the level of the field of Sports Science and Physical Education, external mobility scholarships were allocated for PhD students with a frequency that benefited in 2 stages (Ankara, Turkey, April-June 2018, June-August 2019), PhD student Ionescu Anca (Appendix *A.1.3.3-2). Also, the doctoral student Pelin Bogdan benefited from transport expenses at the FIEP European Congress (Istanbul, Turkey, 26-29.09.2018) (Appendix *A.1.3.3-3). At national level, car transport expenses were reimbursed for the participation of doctoral students (Dobre Andreea, Pelin Bogdan, Alecu Ștefan, Onea Gheorghe) at the Olympiad of young doctoral students organized by IOSUD Pitești. In addition, some PhD students have also participated in either international conferences (Pelin Bogdan - Appendix *A.1.3.3-4) or professional development courses (Trandafir Marius - Appendix *A.1.3.3-5) being supported from other sources of funding.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

[2] The indicators marked with an asterisk (*) hold a special status, referring exclusively to the evaluation of doctoral studies domains, as per Article 12 from the annex No.1 of the Order of the minister of education No. 3651/12.04.2021 approving the Methodology for evaluating university doctoral studies and the system of criteria, standards and performance indicators used in the evaluation. In case they are not met, the Agency extends a period of maximum 3 years to IOSUD to correct the respective deficiencies.

## Criterion A.2. Research infrastructure

*Standard A.2.1. The IOSUD has a modern research infrastructure to support the conduct of doctoral studies' specific activities.*

*The university is constantly improving the infrastructure created to support doctoral students in conducting scientific research.*

***Performance Indicator A.2.1.1.*** *The venues and the material equipment available to the doctoral school enable the research activities in the evaluated domain to be carried out, in line with the assumed mission and objectives (computers, specific software, equipment, laboratory equipment, library, access to international databases etc.). The research infrastructure and the provision of research services are presented to the public through a specific platform. The research infrastructure described above, which was purchased and developed within the past 5 years will be presented distinctly.*

PhD students from the field of Sports Science and Physical Education carry out their research activities both in the laboratory of the research center (Quality of life and human performance) within the Research-Development Institute of Transilvania University of Brașov (Appendix A.2.1.1-1), and also in other laboratories subordinated to the Faculty of Physical Education and Mountain Sports (Biomotor Laboratory, Physical Therapy Laboratory, Massage Laboratory, Fitness Laboratory and Movement Science). The endowment with specific equipment of these laboratories can be found in Appendix A.2.1.1-2. In the last 5 years, both in the Research Laboratory Quality of Life and Human Performance (ICTD) and in our own faculty, the following equipment and software have been purchased and developed:

- Lactate Pro 2 lactic acid analyzer package
- Lactic acid tests LACTATE PRO 2

In the Doctoral field *Sports Science and Physical Education:*

- SCATT MX-W2
- IMU Blue Trident
- Canon Legria HF G26 Camera + Accessories
- Witty Sem 4 traffic lights with tripod
- EEG wireless system
- 13 technical devices for the study of motor capacity development.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

## Criterion A.3. Quality of Human Resources

*Standard A.3.1. At the level of each domain there are sufficient qualified staff to ensure the conduct of doctoral study program.*

***Performance Indicator A.3.1.1.*** *Minimum three doctoral thesis advisors within that doctoral domain, and at least 50% of them (but no less than three) meet the minimum standards of the National Council for Attestation of University Degrees, Diplomas and Certificates (CNATDCU) in force at the time when the evaluation is carried out, which standards are required and mandatory for obtaining the enabling certification.*

The analysis of the data draws the following conclusions:

- actual total number of doctoral supervisors: 4 (2 holders + 2 associated);

- the actual number of doctoral supervisors who meet the minimum necessary and mandatory standards for obtaining the qualification certificate: 3 (75%)

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator *A.3.1.2.*** *At least 50% of all doctoral advisors have a full-time employment contract for an indefinite period with the IOSUD.*

A number of 4 doctoral supervisors work in the doctoral field of Sports Science and Physical Education, of which 2 are holders within IOSUD-Transilvania University of Brașov (representing 50% of the total number of leaders working in the doctoral field). The proving certificates for the titular doctoral supervisors within UTBv are presented (Appendix A.3.1.2-1.).

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator A.3.1.3.*** *The study subjects in the education program based on advanced higher education studies pertaining to the doctoral domain are taught by teaching staff or researchers who are doctoral thesis advisors / certified doctoral thesis advisors, professors / CS I or lecturer / CS II, with proved expertise in the field of the study subjects they teach, or other specialists in the field who meet the standards established by the institution in relation with the aforementioned teaching and research functions, as provided by the law.*

The training program includes common core subjects for the first semester (Appendix A.3.1.3-1), which are taught by lecturers and professors with proven expertise in the field of the subjects taught (Appendix A.3.1.3-2), holders of the university (Appendix A.3.1.3-3), and those of the second semester, called specialized disciplines (established by each scientific supervisor) are taught by people who hold the quality of doctoral supervisor. For disciplines included in the PPUA, the standardization of teachers can be found in the list of positions of SDI (Appendix A.3.1.3-4).

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator *A.3.1.4.*** *The percentage of doctoral thesis advisors who concomitantly coordinate more than 8 doctoral students, but no more than 12, who are themselves studying in doctoral programs[3] does not exceed 20%.*

At the time of the evaluation, no doctoral supervisor in the field of Sports Science and Physical Education has more than 8 PhD students in the internship (Appendix *A.3.1.4-1).

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

[3] 3 years for the doctoral university studies with the duration stipulated at Article 159, paragraph (3), respectively 4 years for the doctoral university studies with the duration stipulated at Article 174, paragraph (3) of the Law of national education No.1/2011 with subsequent amendments and additions, with additional extension periods approved as per Article 39, paragraph (3) of the Code of doctoral studies approved by the GD No. 681/2011 with subsequent amendments and additions.

*Standard A.3.2. The Doctoral advisors within the domain are carrying out a scientific activity visible at international level.*

***Performance Indicator A.3.2.1.*** *At least 50% of the doctoral thesis advisors in the evaluated domain have at least 5 Web of Science- or ERIH-indexed publications in magazines of impact, or other achievements of relevant significance for that domain, including international-level contributions that indicate progress in scientific research - development - innovation for the evaluated domain. The aforementioned doctoral thesis advisors enjoy international awareness within the past five years, consisting of: membership on scientific boards of international publications and conferences; membership on boards of international professional associations; guests in conferences or expert groups working abroad, or membership on doctoral defense commissions at universities abroad or co-leading with universities abroad. For Arts and Sports and Physical Education Sciences, doctoral thesis advisors shall prove their international visibility within the past five years by their membership on the boards of professional associations, membership in organizing committees of arts events and international competitions, membership on juries or umpire teams in artistic events or international competitions.*

At least 5 publications indexed in Web of Science or ERIH in journals with impact factor or other achievements with relevant significance, depending on the specifics of the doctoral field are available.

There is an international visibility of the supervisiors on the last 5 years.

From the analysis of the data presented it is found that the 3 doctoral supervisors meet both subcomponents of the indicator.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator *A.3.2.2.*** *At least 50% of the doctoral thesis advisors in a specific doctoral study domain continue to be active in their scientific field, and acquire at least 25% of the score requested by the minimal CNATDCU standards in force at the time of the evaluation, which are required and mandatory for acquiring their enabling certificate, based on their scientific results within the past five years.*

According to the data presented, all 3 doctoral supervisors affiliated at the time of evaluation, meet the required score for this indicator based on scientific results from the last 5 years.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Domain B. EDUCATIONAL EFFECTIVENESS***

**Criterion B.1. The number, quality and diversity of candidates enrolled for the admission contest**

*Standard B.1.1. The institution organizing doctoral studies has the capacity to attract candidates from outside the higher education institution or a number of candidates exceeding the number of seats available.*

*The university is an attractive educational institution for candidates who have graduated from other universities.*

***Performance Indicator *B.1.1.1.*** *The ratio between the number of graduates of masters' programs of other higher education institutions, national or foreign, who have enrolled for the doctoral admission contest within the past five years and the number of seats funded by the state budget, put out through contest within the doctoral domain is at least 0.2 or the ratio between the number of candidates within the*

*past five years and the number of seats funded by the state budget put out through contest within the doctoral studies domain is at least 1,2.*

Regarding the field of Sports Science and Physical Education, analyzed in this report, the following are found:

Criteria 1:

- The values calculated for the admissions from 2016, 2017, 2019 and 2020 are above the reference value of 0,2;
- Overall value for the reported period 2016-2020 is 1.10, above the minimum value of 0,2 required.

Criteria 2:

- The values calculated for the admissions from 2016, 2018, 2019 and 2020 are above the reference value of 1.2;
- Overall value for the reported period 2016-2020 is 2, above the minimum value of 1,2 required.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

*Standard B.1.2 Candidates admitted to doctoral studies demonstrate academic, research and professional performance.*

*Candidates who apply to the doctoral school of the university demonstrate good academic and scientific achievements in the professional field.*

***Performance Indicator *B.1.2.1.*** *Admission to doctoral study programs is based on selection criteria including: previous academic, research and professional performance, their interest for scientific or arts/sports research, publications in the domain and a proposal for a research subject. Interviewing the candidate is compulsory, as part of the admission procedure.*

Admission to doctoral studies is based on a competition, according to the Admission Methodology updated annually and approved by the Senate (https://www.unitbv.ro/documente/cercetare/doctoratpostdoctorat/metodologii rapoarte/Metodologia_de_admitere_la_doctorat20). It transposes at the level of IOSUD - UniTBv the provisions of the Framework Methodology regarding the organization of admission in the cycles of undergraduate, master and doctoral studies, approved by OMEC 6.102/2016, with subsequent completions and modifications (ex 3199/2021), implementing at the same time internal quality standards.

Thus, the enrollment in the admission competition is conditioned by the previous academic performance, respectively the average of the bachelor years of minimum 7 (seven) and the average of the master studies of minimum 7 (seven), where applicable (Art.13.3). Eligibility for places financed from the state budget is conditioned by the graduation average of the license cycle of at least 8.50 (arithmetic mean between the average of the years of undergraduate studies and the average of the bachelor's exam) (Art.13.4) (Appendix B.1.2 .1-1).

The doctoral admission contest takes place in the form of a specialized exam with one or more tests (written or oral) specific to the doctoral field, of which an interview with the candidate is mandatory (Art. 22). The topics/themes put up for competition at the proposal of the doctoral supervisors are approved by the SDI Council with the consultation of the doctoral field coordinators. The number and type of competition tests for each doctoral field is approved by the SDI Council at the proposal of the doctoral

field coordinators, considering their specificity. Information on the topics in the contest and how to conduct the contest is published on the website for informing candidates (https://www.unitbv.ro/cercetare/doctorat-postdoctorat-siabilitare/admitere/tematica-admitere.html).

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator B.1.2.2.*** *The expelling rate, including renouncement/dropping out of doctoral students 3, respectively 4, years after admission[4] does not exceed 30%.*

Regarding the field of Sports Science and Physical Education, the following are found:

- For the group of PhD students admitted in 2013 and 2015, the values calculated for dropout rates are 0% and 28.57%, and for the other years, the values are above the maximum threshold of 30%.
- As an overall value for the reported period (admissions from the 2013-2017 interval), the calculated value is 30.43%, slightly above the maximum value of 30%.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is partially fulfilled.***

**Criterion B.2. The content of doctoral programs**

*Students are trained in quality educational programs that reflect the development of sports science.*

*Standard B.2.1. The training program based on advanced university studies is appropriate to improve doctoral students' research skills and to strengthen ethical behavior in science.*

*The curricula are aimed at developing research skills and ethical behavior in the scientific field.*

***Performance Indicator B.2.1.1.*** *The training program based on advanced academic studies includes at least 3 disciplines relevant to the scientific research training of doctoral students; at least one of these disciplines is intended to study in-depth the research methodology and/or the statistical data processing.*

The training program includes relevant disciplines for training in scientific research of PhD students (Methodologies of research on body activities, IT methodologies in the study of human motor skills, Theory and curricular methodology in physical education and sports), of which the discipline Methodologies of research on body activities is intended for in-depth study of the methodology of research and statistical data processing (Appendix B.2.1.1-1). The educational disciplines included in the curriculum are presented in Appendix B.2.1.1-2.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator B.2.1.2.*** *At least one discipline is dedicated to Ethics and Intellectual Property in scientific research or there are well-defined topics on these subjects within a discipline taught in the doctoral program.*

The curriculum of the field of Sports Science and Physical Education includes the discipline "Ethics and academic integrity" (Appendix B.2.1.1-2)

*Recommendations:*

[4] 3 years for the doctoral university studies with the duration stipulated at Article 159, paragraph (3), respectively 4 years for the doctoral university studies with the duration stipulated at Article 174, paragraph (3) of the Law of national education No. 1/2011 with subsequent amendments and additions.

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator B.2.1.3.*** *The IOSUD has mechanisms to ensure that the academic training program based on advanced university studies addresses „the learning outcomes", specifying the knowledge, skills, responsibility and autonomy that doctoral students should acquire after completing each discipline or through the research activities*[5].

The training program based on advanced university studies includes two distinct modules (parts), intended for the acquisition of knowledge, training of skills specific to the field, useful in successfully completing the doctoral program in the field of Sports Science and Physical Education (PPUA module 1), respectively responsibilities and autonomy in the research activity, correlated with the doctoral / research topic approached by each PhD student within the doctoral field (module PPUA 2).

The training program based on advanced university studies PPUA 1 is oriented towards learning outcomes, each discipline in the Curriculum (Appendix B.2.1.3-1) aiming at the formation of competencies clearly specified in the subject sheets and followed throughout the doctoral students/ discipline. Verification forms for PPUA 1 subjects are designed to assess learning outcomes and to contribute themselves to the training of targeted competencies and to the acquisition of an appropriate degree of independence/autonomy of PhD students in the creative/applied use of knowledge, formulation of conclusions, foreshadowing applicability in approaching one's own research topics and assuming responsibly, in the spirit of the principles of ethics and academic integrity, the implicit research approach.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator B.2.1.4.*** *All along the duration of the doctoral training, doctoral students in the domain receive counselling/guidance from functional guidance commissions, which is reflected in written guidance and feedback or regular meeting.*

Each PhD student benefits from the counseling / guidance of a guidance commission composed of 3 specialized teachers, doctors in the field of Sports Science and Physical Education, Medical Sciences and Economic Sciences - Management. The commissions are found in the individual doctoral program submitted to SDI. At each specialized examination included in the PPUA structure, a report is drawn up in which the members of the steering committee express their views on the PhD student performance, the timeliness and relevance of the information presented arguing the value of the grade awarded (Appendix B.2.1.4-1). For the scientific research program (PPCA), following the submission of the reports, the guidance committee formulates observations and recommendations to guide, correct and support the scientific path of the doctoral student (Appendix B.2.1.4-2).

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator B.2.1.5****. For a doctoral study domain, the ratio between the number of doctoral students and the number of teaching staff/researchers providing doctoral guidance must not exceed 3:1.*

[5] Or by what the graduate should know, understand and to be able to do, according to the provisions of the Methodology of 17 March 2017 regarding inscription and registration of higher education qualifications in the National Register of Qualifications in Higher Education (RNCIS) approved by the Order No.3475/2017 with subsequent amendments and additions.

The ratio between the number of doctoral students and the number of teachers providing guidance, for the doctoral field Science of Sport and Physical Education, is 16:10, respectively 1.60, compared to 3:1, respectively 3.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

**Criterion B.3. The results of doctoral studies and procedures for their evaluation.**

*The results of the doctoral study are visible and there are clear procedures for their evaluation.*

*Standard B.3.1. Doctoral students capitalize on the research through presentations at scientific conferences, scientific publications, technological transfer, patents, products and service orders.*

*The results of the research of the doctoral students are presented at scientific conferences and projects, published in scientific journals.*

***Performance Indicator B.3.1.1.*** *For the evaluated domain, the evaluation commission will be provided with at least one paper or some other relevant contribution per doctoral student who has obtained a doctor's title within the past 5 years. From this list, the members of the evaluation commission shall randomly select 5 such papers / relevant contributions per doctoral study domain for review. At least 3 selected papers must contain significant original contributions in the respective domain.*

In the last 5 years (01.01.2016-31.12.2020), within the doctoral field of Sports Science and Physical Education, a number of 7 doctoral theses have been completed / presented, according to the situation. For all the 7 graduates of doctoral studies, at least one article or another relevant contribution was sent/collected, the centralizers (lists of papers) and publications being included in Appendix B.3.1.1-1 (organized/structured on doctoral supervisors).

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator *B.3.1.2.*** *The ratio between the number of presentations of doctoral students who completed their doctoral studies within the evaluated period (past 5 years), including posters, exhibitions made at prestigious international events (organized in the country or abroad) and the number of doctoral students who have completed their doctoral studies within the evaluated period (past 5 years) is at least 1.*

During the evaluated period, 26 works were presented, including posters at prestigious international events held in the country or abroad. Thus, the ratio between the number of papers and the number of doctoral students who have completed their doctoral studies in the last 5 years (7) is 3.71 (Appendix *B.3.1.2-1).

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

*Standard B.3.2. The Doctoral School engages a significant number of external scientific specialists in the commissions for public defense of doctoral theses in the analyzed domain.*

***Performance Indicator *B.3.2.1.*** *The number of doctoral theses allocated to one specialist coming from a higher education institution, other than the evaluated IOSUD should not exceed two (2) in a year for the theses coordinated by the same doctoral thesis advisor.*

In the doctoral field of Sports Science and Physical Education were not identified in the centralizing situations of SDI more than two doctoral theses / doctoral supervisor, presented in one year, assigned to the same referent from a higher education institution. A single doctoral supervisor (Balint Lorand) coordinated two doctoral theses presented in the same year (2018 and 2020, respectively) (Appendix B.3.2.1-1).

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator *B.3.2.2.*** *The ratio between the doctoral theses allocated to one scientific specialist coming from a higher education institution, other than the institution where the defense on the doctoral thesis is organized, and the number of doctoral theses presented in the same doctoral study domain in the doctoral school should not exceed 0.3, considering the past five years. Only those doctoral study domains in which minimum ten doctoral theses have been presented within the past five years should be analyzed.*

NOT THE CASE (total number of doctoral theses defended in the field of Sports Science and Physical Education, in the last 5 years = 7).

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Domain C. QUALITY MANAGEMENT***

**Criterion C.1. Existence and periodic implementation of the internal quality assurance system**

*Standard C.1.1. There are an institutional framework and procedures in place and relevant internal quality assurance policies, applied for monitoring the internal quality assurance.*

*Clear and transparent procedures and policies for educational quality management have been established.*

***Performance Indicator C.1.1.1.*** *The Doctoral school in the respective university study domain shall demonstrate the continuous development of the evaluation process and its internal quality assurance following a procedure developed and applied at the level of the IOSUD, the following assessed criteria being mandatory:*

In order to evaluate and monitor internally the evolution of the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School (SDI) and the doctoral fields operating within SDI, the following methodologies were developed and implemented (covering the criteria / aspects mentioned in this indicator - the scientific activity of doctoral supervisors, the infrastructure and logistics necessary to carry out the research activity, the procedures and the subsequent norms on the basis of which the doctoral studies are organized):

- The methodology regarding the internal evaluation of the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School from IOSUD-UniTBv (developed and applied in 2016);
- Methodology for periodic internal evaluation of the activity of doctoral supervisors (developed and applied in 2018).

The methodology regarding the internal evaluation of the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School, presented in Appendix C.1.1.1-1, was elaborated by the Council for University Doctoral Studies (CSUD), being approved by the CSUD Decision no. 5 from 6.06.2016. The methodology is available for consultation on the IOSUD-UniTBv website (https://www.unitbv.ro/documente/cercetare/doctorat-postdoctorat/metodologiirapoarte/Metodologie_evaluare_interna_SDI.pdf).

The methodology of periodic internal evaluation of the activity of doctoral supervisors, presented in Appendix C.1.1.1-4, was elaborated - adopted by the Council for University Doctoral Studies (CSUD) by CSUD Decision no. 31 of 7.03.2018, being subsequently approved by the University Senate by Decision no. 22 from 09.05.2018. The methodology is available for consultation on the IOSUD-UniTBv website (https://unitbv.ro/documente/despre-unitbv/regulamente-hotarari/regulamenteleuniversitatii/angajati/Metodologie_evaluare_activ_cond_doct.pdf).

The activity of doctoral students, regardless of the form of training and funding, is assessed on the basis of the specific Instruction IS-5 of the SDI Regulation (Appendix C.1.1.1-7). The evaluation is performed monthly, by the doctoral supervisor, and respectively annually based on an activity report (prepared according to the form IS-5-F5a in Appendix C.1.1.1-7), by presenting the activities carried out and the results obtained the doctoral supervisor and the guidance commission, in accordance with the provisions of Art. 9 par. (8) of the SDI Regulation.

The activity of doctoral students, regardless of the form of training and funding, is assessed on the basis of the specific Instruction IS-5 of the SDI Regulation (Appendix C.1.1.1-7). The evaluation is performed monthly, by the doctoral supervisor, and respectively annually based on an activity report (prepared according to the form IS-5-F5a in Appendix C.1.1.1-7), by presenting the activities carried out and the results obtained the doctoral supervisor and the guidance commission, in accordance with the provisions of Art. 9 par. (8) of the SDI Regulation.

PhD students benefit from internal programs to stimulate research performance: “ISI / Clarivate Analytics Awards” (allocation of 4000 lei / SRI unit for articles published in ISI WoS / Clarivate Analytics rated journals with SRI> 0.1), “Conferences with indexed volume ISI / Clarivate Analytics” (allocation of 1000 lei / year for eligible expenses in order to participate in scientific conferences whose volume is indexed ISI Proceedings), “Fees for publishing articles in ISI / Clarivate Analytics listed journals” (payment of fees for publishing articles in ISI / Clarivate Analytics listed journals). The programs are approved by the Board of Directors of the University and are monitored by the Project Management Office, being implemented according to the internal procedures within the quality management system.

The counseling services provided to the students of the Transilvania University of Brașov, therefore implicitly to the PhD students, are provided based on the Instruction on the career counseling activity within CICOC – Career Information, Counseling and Guidance Center (Appendix C.1.1.1-12), the reversal in force being approved by the Decision of the Board of Directors no. 6 from 1.06.2016.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator *C.1.1.2.*** *Mechanisms are implemented during the stage of the doctoral study program to enable feedback from doctoral students allowing to identify their needs, as well as their overall level of satisfaction with the doctoral study program in order to ensure continuous improvement of the academic and administrative processes. Following the analysis of the results, there is evidence that an action plan was drafted and implemented.*

SDI has created the functional tools for consulting PhD students regarding their level of satisfaction with the doctoral program and identifying their needs in order to increase quality. Thus, the specific Instruction IS-7 regarding the decision-making regarding the content and structure of the PPUA (https://www.unitbv.ro/documente/cercetare/doctorat-postdoctorat/metodologii-rapoarte/v2/IS-7 Structura_continutul_PPUA_-v2.pdf), annex to the SDI Regulation, presents the stages and the decisionmaking mechanism regarding the opportunity to modify / periodically update the structure and content of the advanced university training program - PPUA - module I - transversal competences. Instruction IS-7 includes specific questionnaires for surveying the opinion of PhD supervisors (Form IS-7-F1) and PhD students (Form IS-7-F2 - Appendix * C.1.1.2-1) Feedback from PhD students, periodically consulted through the specific questionnaire (IS-7-F2) is an important element in making a decision at the level of the SDI Council regarding the modification / updating of the curricula on the basis of which the PPUA I module is carried out. The SDI Council annually analyzes the content / structure of the PPUA and its relevance in the training of PhD students, in order to ensure the formation of useful competencies for each doctoral field and may propose a reasoned change of the PPUA structure or reconfiguration of the content of some disciplines.

At the level of IOSUD-UniTBv, respectively of the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School (SDI), this specific mechanism for collecting feedback from PhD students has been implemented since 2017.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

**Criterion C.2. Transparency of information and accessibility of learning resources**

*Full transparency of information and access to learning resources is ensured.*

*Standard C.2.1. Information of interest to doctoral students, future candidates and public interest information is available for electronic format consultation.*

*All necessary public information for access to the doctoral school and for the doctoral students is published online.*

***Performance Indicator C.2.1.1.*** *The IOSUD publishes on the website of the organizing institution, in compliance with the general regulations on data protection, information such as:*

On the IOSUD-Transilvania University of Brașov website (https://www.unitbv.ro), which also includes a section dedicated to the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School (https://www.unitbv.ro/cercetare/doctorat-postdoctorat-siabilitare.html), as well as on the intranet platform of the university - Doctorate section (https://intranet.unitbv.ro/Cercetare/Scoala-Doctorala-Interdisciplinara/Doctorat), are available for consultation all the information specified in this indicator, as it follows:

a) https://unitbv.ro/documente/despre-unitbv/regulamente-hotarari/regulamenteleuniversitatii/studenti/Regulament_ul_scolii_doctorale_19.07.2017.pdf

b)https://www.unitbv.ro/documente/despre-unitbv/regulamente-hotarari/regulamenteleuniversitatii/studenti/Metodologia_de_admitere_la_doctorat_2021.pdf

c)https://unitbv.ro/documente/cercetare/doctorat-postdoctorat/contracte/1-UniTBv-Contract_studii_doctorale_2020_cu_acord_publicare-30.03.pdf

d)https://unitbv.ro/documente/cercetare/doctorat-postdoctorat/metodologii-rapoarte/v2/2020-IS-8-Finalizare_si_sustinere_teze-v6-aprobata_CSUD.pdf

e)https://intranet.unitbv.ro/Cercetare/Scoala-Doctorala-Interdisciplinara/Doctorat/Program individualdoctorat (PPUA I DISCIPLINES section - PRESENTATION)
f) https://www.unitbv.ro/cercetare/doctorat-postdoctorat-si-abilitare/despre-scoaladoctorala/ domenii-de-doctorat-si-conducatori respectively https://www.unitbv.ro/cercetare/doctorat-postdoctorat-si-abilitare/admitere/tematicaadmitere.html
g) https://www.unitbv.ro/cercetare/doctorat-postdoctorat-si-abilitare/doctorat-si-postdoctorat.html (section PhD students in internship) respectively https://intranet.unitbv.ro/Cercetare/Scoala- Doctorala-Interdisciplinara/Doctorat/Doctoranzi-in-stagiu
h) https://www.unitbv.ro/documente/cercetare/doctoratpostdoctorat/ anunturi/Ghid_elaborare_teza.pdf
i) https://www.unitbv.ro/cercetare/doctorat-postdoctorat-si-abilitare/doctoranzi/sustinere-teza.html

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

*Standard C.2.2. The IOSUD/The Doctoral School provides doctoral students with access to the resources needed for conducting doctoral studies.*

*The doctoral school provides access to all necessary resources for conducting the training.*

***Performance Indicator C.2.2.1.*** *All doctoral students have free access to one platform providing academic databases relevant to the doctoral studies domain of their thesis.*

The list of relevant academic databases, with free access by all PhD students, for the reported period, is presented in Appendix C.2.2.1-1, details on contracting and implementing this service, carried out through the Library of Transilvania University of Brașov.

For the PhD in Sports Science and Physical Education, PhD students have free access to the following academic databases: Direct Freedom Collection, Elsevier, Springerlink Journals, Springer, Web of Science - Core Collection, InCites Journal Citation Reports, Dervent Innovation Index, Clarivate Analitics, ProQuest Central and Scopus. Also, in this context, the UniTBv Library provides PhD students with the information and support needed to use databases throughout the doctoral program.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator C.2.2.2.*** *Each doctoral student shall have access, upon request, to an electronic system for verifying the degree of similarity with other existing scientific or artistic works.*

For the consolidation of the educational actions in the Transilvania University of Brașov, within the CNFIS – FDI-2018-0851 institutional development project: "Pragmatism and professionalism in education in the field of scientific research ethics - premise of authentic creativity" (Appendix C.2.2.2-1), coordinated by prof. Univ. dr. Liliana Rogozea, chairman of the commission for the ethics of scientific research at the Faculty of Medicine, software services were purchased to verify the originality of the studies, through the Turnitin program, starting with 1.09.2018 (Appendix C.2.2.2- 2) for a period of 4 years, until 31.08.2022 (Appendix A.1.2.2-2).

Access to the Turnitin computer system is provided for all university teachers, respectively all doctoral supervisors (including external and retired), all university PhD students. The acquisition of this software completed the software services for verifying the similarities in the scientific papers available / implemented within IOSUD-UniTBv, adding to the Sistemantiplagiat.ro service, used since July 2016 by the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School to verify all doctoral theses (as presented to the analysis of criterion

A.1.2.2). Both software used are on the list of programs recognized by CNATDCU in order to establish the degree of similarity for scientific papers (OM 5229/2020 / Appendix 2 / Art. 6c).

Through the free access of all PhD students, throughout the doctoral studies starting from the first year, as well as of the doctoral supervisors to the Turnitin system, the conditions for an efficient education in the spirit of ethics and academic integrity are ensured, by the possibility for each PhD student to check the papers / reports prepared before their submission, make their own assessment and better understand how to put into practice the rules of academic writing, how to cite sources and write bibliographic references.

In the same coherent approach of UniTBv for the promotion of ethical principles in academic research, the writing and distribution to all PhD students and doctoral supervisors from IOSUD-UniTBv of the brochure Guide of good practices in academic research is included. The guide, made by a team of teachers from IOSUD - UniTBv, coordinated by Mrs. prof.dr. Liliana Rogozea within the CNFIS – FDI-2018-0450 institutional development project.

In the field of Sports Science and Physical Education, all PhD students engaged in various stages of training have access to the Turnitin system, and upon completion of the doctoral thesis, the anti-plagiarism report is a mandatory condition for public support. After uploading and processing the document, the system generates a proof of access to it (Appendix C.2.2-5). Based on the report issued by the system, the scientific leader prepares the resolution with the argumentation of the coefficients obtained (Appendix C.2.2-6).

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator C.2.2.3.*** *All doctoral students have access to scientific research laboratories or other facilities depending on the specific domain/domains within the Doctoral School, according to internal order procedures.*

PhD students in the field of Sports Science and Physical Education have access, both to the scientific research laboratories of the university, according to the procedure regarding the use of research resources established at the university level (Appendix A.1.1.2.-10), and to the other laboratories of the faculty, according to internal regulations (Appendix C.2.2.3-1). Also, due to the specificity of the field, PhD students have access to all preuniversity education units in Brașov County, based on a collaboration protocol concluded with ISJ Brașov (Appendix C.2.2.3-2), in some clubs and associations regional sports (Appendix C.2.2.3-3), as well as in the National Research Institute for Sports (Appendix C.2.2.3-4).

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

**Criterion C.3. Internationalization**

*Standard C.3.1. There is a strategy in place and it is applied to enhance the internationalization of doctoral studies.*

*A strategy for improving the internationalization process of the doctoral school has been adopted and is being implemented.*

***Performance Indicator *C.3.1.1.*** *IOSUD, for every evaluated domain, has concluded mobility agreements with universities abroad, with research institutes, with companies working in the field of study, aimed at the mobility of doctoral students and academic staff (e.g., ERASMUS agreements for the doctoral studies). At least 35% of the doctoral students have completed a training course abroad or other*

*mobility forms such as attending international scientific conferences. IOSUD drafts and applies policies and measures aiming at increasing the number of doctoral students participating at mobility periods abroad, up to at least 20%, which is the target at the level of the European Higher Education Area.*

Increasing the level of internationalization of the university is a strategic objective assumed by the Strategic Plan of the Transilvania University of Brașov (https://www.unitbv.ro/documente/despre-unitbv/info-interespublic/transparenta-insitutiunea/planuri/plan- strategic/Plan_strategic_2020-2024.pdf), objective pursued coherently through specific programs, actions and measures. In the IOSUD-UniTBv strategy, the intense promotion of internationalization actions represents a means of increasing and diversifying the performances of the university community, implicitly of the quality of the doctoral university studies.

The internationalization strategy of the Transilvania University of Brașov (https://www.unitbv.ro/documente/despre-unitbv/info-interes-public/transparentainsitutială/ planuri/interna%C8%9Bionalizare/Strategia_de_internationalizare_lb._romana_2020-2024.) includes specific objectives, including the stimulation of the participation of teachers and students (from all study cycles) in international mobility and cooperation funded by national and international agencies/ organizations.

In this context, the ERASMUS+ program (https://www.unitbv.ro/studenti/erasmus.html), represents an important pillar in the internationalization strategy of UniTBv and SDI. Updated inter-institutional agreements are currently active, including the 3rd cycle of doctoral studies, concluded through this program between the Transilvania University of Brașov and a number of 205 universities from EU and associated member states (K103 program), respectively partner countries (third parties) (program K107) (Appendix C.3.1.1-1).

There is a small number of outgoing Erasmus mobilities during the assessed period. In order to remedy this situation, at the level of the institution an ERASMUS SDI coordinator from January 2020 was appointed (prof. Dr. Maria Stoicănescu) and an information strategy for doctoral students was implemented, which promoted events such as: DOCTORAND 2019, Doctoral Student 2020 , ERASMUS OPEN DAY 2020.

The mobility was carried out by Prof. dr. Lorand Balint, at Buckinghamshire New University, Great Britain, for a period of 5 days, in the academic year 2018/2019. Within it, didactic teaching and assistance activities were carried out, as well as introductory sessions in collecting research data, using specialized equipment and software.

In addition to the ERASMUS+ program, UniTBv PhD students benefit from other opportunities / funding sources for carrying out mobility abroad, such as training / research internships, participation in international conferences, workshops or summer schools, which are funded from budget allocation, national and international research projects, the university's own funds and the doctoral mobility scholarship fund.

In the case of the doctoral studies field Sports Science and Physical Education, for the percentages calculated differently on the two categories, PhD students in legal extension/grace (percentage 1) and respectively PhD students who have already presented the theses (2 percent), the values are 55.55% and 28.57%, respectively. For the criterion 1, the value is 55,55% (min. 35%), regarding the PhD students in internship and the value is below the recommended limit (28.57% compared to 35%) for the criterion 2.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is partially fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator C.3.1.2.*** *In the evaluated doctoral study domain, support is granted, including financial support, to the organization of doctoral studies in international co-tutelage or invitation of leading experts to deliver courses/lectures for doctoral students.*

During the reporting period, PhD students from various doctoral fields benefited from courses, lectures, workshops, meetings, etc. with specialists/experts/professors invited from abroad, their presence being facilitated through the ERASMUS+ program (incoming teaching mobility) and other specific programs developed in the university (e.g. Fellowship for Visiting Professors).

In the last 5 years, PhD students in the field of Sports Science and Physical Education in terms of teaching mobility incoming ERASMUS + have benefited from the visit of Prof. Fețeu Dorin, from Buckinghamshire New University, Great Britain (2018 and 2019), who gave a series of lectures and practical activities on specific motor skills and examples of statistical processing of the collected data. Also, between 25.02 - 05.03.2020 (10 days), the Faculty of Physical Education and Mountain Sports had Prof. Dr. Rodolfo Buenaventura as guest, General Secretary of FIEP WORLD (International Federation of Physical Education), Universidad Nacional de Lujan, Buenos Aires, Argentina, as part of the Guests at Transilvania University program. (Appendix C.3.1.2-3) He carried out a series of theoretical-methodical and practical activities (open lessons) in which the PhD students of our field also participated.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator C.3.1.3.*** *The internationalization of activities carried out during the doctoral studies is supported by IOSUD through concrete measures (e.g., by participating in educational fairs to attract international doctoral students; by including international experts in guidance committees or doctoral committees, etc.).*

The support of the internationalization of the activities within the doctoral studies is result from the preoccupations for attracting foreign PhD students of incoming type, from the EC and EEA countries, but also from third countries, as well as the granting of some forms of support for them.

Appendix C.3.1.3-1 presents the list of foreign PhD students enrolled at IOSUD-UniTBV in internship at the reporting date. For the field of Sports Science and Physical Education, in the period 2016 - 2019, Mr. ALNU'MAN Natheir Faisal Mansour, Jordanian citizen, attended and completed his doctoral studies.

Appendix C.3.1.3-2 presents the situation of ERASMUS + incoming international PhD students, who performed mobility / training / research internships within IOSUD UTBv during the reporting period.
A conclusive example of IOSUD-UniTBv's actions to attract international PhD students is the Transilvania Academica Scholarship (TAS) program (https://tas.unitbv.ro/) which grants, on the basis of competition, a number of up to 15 scholarships from the university's own income to the best performing international students from non-EU or EEA countries.

Appendix C.3.1.3-5 presents the situation of the international PhD students beneficiaries of the Eugen Ionescu research scholarships, who carried out research internships at the Transilvania University of Brașov during the reporting period. The Eugen Ionescu scholarship program is funded by the Romanian Government, through the Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MFA) and carried out on the basis of cooperation between the MFA, the Ministry of Education and the Office for Central and Eastern Europe of the University Agency of La Francophonie (AUFECO). Through this annual program, PhD students and post-doc researchers from member states of the International Organization of La Francophonie, who study in

AUF member universities, benefit from the funding of research mobility in Romanian universities, AUF members.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

**IV. SWOT Analysis**

| | |
|---|---|
| **Strengths:**<br>use of modern teaching methods (IT and multimedia equipment);<br>the existence of laboratories and modern research infrastructure at the UNITBV scientific research centres;<br>access to software packages for research within the Centres of the University's Research and Development Institute (ICDT) and to various software resources through the Microsoft Imagine programme;<br>the existence of IT infrastructure and online platforms (intranet, e-learning);<br>the existence and adequate functioning at the university level of the management structures;<br>the existence of a democratic, transparent decision-making system, as well as for their communication in the academic environment | **Weaknesses**<br>the small number of theses written in international co-supervision;<br>dropping out of students due to another type of commitment and professional activity;<br>small number of incoming and outcoming Erasmus mobility for students |
| **Opportunities:**<br>framing the major research themes within SDI in the local and regional development strategy;<br>strengthening the collaboration with the socio-economic environment and developing the system for calibrating doctoral research topics in accordance with the development needs of the specific interest to the field of Sports Science and Physical Education;<br>the existence of a fruitful collaboration in the interdisciplinary fields specific to the doctoral school with relevant international universities;<br>the national and European research strategy requires the training of highly qualified specialists/ doctors in the doctoral fields of Sports Science and Physical Education, who will respond to the needs of the labour market; | **Threats:**<br>national and international competition in the field of doctoral studies to attract doctoral students and financial resources;<br>migration of Romanian university graduates to institutions abroad or to the labour market in other countries;<br>decrease in the capacity to attract doctoral students, due to the reduction in the number of tenured PhD supervisors (especially through retirement);<br>lack of attractiveness of the existing doctoral research scholarships/grants;<br>lower availability of representative institutions from the field of activity for investments in the training of highly qualified specialists and for doctoral research |

| | |
|---|---|
| the national/international collaborations of UNITBV allow the permanent contact with the technical scientific achievements from the fields of research, as well as the assurance of quality of the formative processes of the doctoral students and of scientific research, at the European standards | |

## V. Overview of judgments awarded and of the recommendations

| Crt No. | Indicator type (*, IPC) | Performance indicator | Ratings | Recommendations |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| A.1.1.1. | | The existence of specific regulations and their application at the level of IOSUD | Positive evaluation | |
| A.1.1.2. | | The Regulation of the School for Doctoral studies includes criteria, procedures and mandatory standards for the aspects specified in art. 17, paragraph 5, from the Code of doctoral studies, approved by HG 681/2011 with subsequent amendments and additions | Positive evaluation | |
| A.1.2.1. | | The existence and effectiveness of an adequate computer system for the record of doctoral students and their academic background. | Positive evaluation | |
| A.1.2.2. | | The existance and use of a computer program and proves of its usage in order to check all the docotral theses percentage of similarity | Positive evaluation | |
| A.1.3.1. | | The existence of at least one research or institutional development / human resources grant in implementation at the | Positive evaluation | |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | time of submitting the self-assessment file, per field of doctoral studies or the existence of at least 2 research or institutional development / human resources grants per field of doctoral studies obtained by doctoral supervisors in the evaluated field in the last 5 years. | | |
| A.1.3.2. | * | The proportion of doctoral students existing at the time of assessment, who benefit for a minimum of six months from sources other than government funding, through scholarships granted by individuals or legal entities or are financially supported by research or institutional development / human resources grants, is not less than 20%. | Positive evaluation | |
| A.1.3.3. | * | At least 10% of the total amounts related to the doctoral grants obtained by the university through the institutional contract and tuition fees collected from doctoral students are used to reimburse the training expenses of doctoral students (participation in conferences, summer schools, internships abroad, publication of specialized articles or other specific forms of dissemination, etc.). | Positive evaluation | |
| A.2.1.1. | IPC | The spaces and material endowment of IOSUD/The Schools for Doctoral studies allow the research activities to be carried out, in the evaluated field, in accordance with the mission and objectives assumed (computers, specific software, installations, laboratory equipment, library, | Positive evaluation | |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | access to international databases, etc). The research infrastructure and the research service offer are publicly presented through a profile platform. The research infrastructure described above, acquired and developed in the last 5 years, will be highlighted separately. | | |
| A.3.1.1. | IPC | Within the doctoral field, at least three doctoral supervisors carry out their activity and at least 50% of them (but not less than three) meet the minimum CNATDCU standards in force at the time of the evaluation, necessary and mandatory for obtaining the habilitation certificate. | Positive evaluation | |
| A.3.1.2. | IPC | At least 50% of the doctoral supervisors in the evaluated doctoral field are postholders within IOSUD, hired based on an unfixed-term contract. The status of holder within the IOSUD analyzed means that doctoral supervisor who has a full-time employment contract for an indefinite period in the IOSUD' coordinating higher education institution or in one of the component institutions of the consortium that forms IOSUD or the partnerships concluded under the conditions of art. 6 of GD no. 681/2011, with subsequent amendments and completions. | Positive evaluation | |
| A.3.1.3. | | The courses of the program based on advanced university studies related to the field are held by professors or researchers who have the title of doctoral/habilitated supervisor, professor/CS I or | Positive evaluation | |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | associate professor/CS II with proven expertise in the field of the taught courses or other specialists in field that meet the standards established by the institution for the aforementioned teaching and research positions, under the law. | | |
| A.3.1.4. | * | The share of doctoral supervisors who sumiltaniously supervise at the same time more than 8 doctoral students, but no more than 12, during their doctoral studies 3 or 4 years, depending on the field, to which are added the extension periods granted according to art. 39, para. (3) of GD no. 681/2011, with subsequent amendments and completions), does not exceed 20%. | Positive evaluation | |
| A.3.2.1. | | At least 50% of the doctoral supervisors in the field, subject to evaluation, present at least 5 publications indexed Web of Science or ERIH in journals with impact factor or other achievements, with significant relevance to the related field, in which there are international contributions that reveal a progress in scientific research-development-innovation for the evaluated field. The mentioned doctoral supervisors have had international visibility in the last five years, consisting in: membership in the scientific committees of the international publications and conferences; membership in the boards of international professional associations; as guest at conferences or groups of experts held abroad or as a member of | Positive evaluation | |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | committees for the presentation of doctoral theses at foreign universities or in joint supervision with a foreign university. For the fields of science: Arts and Sports and Physical Education Science, the doctoral supervisors will prove the international visibility in the last five years by being a member of the boards of international professional associations, by being a member of the organizing committees of artistic events and international competitions, respectively by membership in juries or arbitration teams in artistic events or international competitions. | | |
| A.3.2.2. | * | At least 50% of the doctoral supervisors assigned to a field of doctoral studies continue to be scientifically active, obtaining at least 25% of the score required by the CNATDCU minimum standards in force at the time of evaluation, necessary and mandatory to obtain the habilitation certificate, based on scientific results in the last five years. | Positive evaluation | |
| B.1.1.1. | * | The ratio between the number of master graduates of other national and international higher education institutions who registred for admission to doctoral studies in the last five years and the number of seats financed by the state budget put up for competition within the school for doctoral studies is at least 0.2 | Positive evaluation | |
| B.1.2.2. | * | The dropout rate of doctoral students 2 years after admission does not exceed 30%. | Partially positive evaluation | Carrying out a pro-active counseling, in the online environment, for PhD |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | | students engaged in high level sports.<br><br>Motivating PhD students by involving them in research teams associated with the topics addressed in their doctoral theses. |
| B.2.1.1. | | The training program based on advanced university studies comprises at least three relevant courses for preparing the doctoral students in scientific research, among which at least one course is intended for the in-depth study of the research methodology and / or statistical data processing. | Positive evaluation | |
| B.2.1.2. | | There is at least one course dedicated to ethics in scientific research and well-defined intellectual or thematic property on these topics within a course taught in the doctoral program | Positive evaluation | |
| B.2.1.3. | | IOSUD has created mechanisms to ensure that the training program based on advanced university studies, related to the evaluated field, focus on "learning outcomes", specifying the knowledge, skills and responsibility and autonomy that doctoral students should achieve after completing each course or by research activities | Positive evaluation | |
| B.2.1.4. | | Throughout the doctoral stage, doctoral students in the field benefit from the advice / guidance of functional supervision committee, aspect reflected by guidance and written feedback or regular meetings. | Positive evaluation | |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| B.2.1.5. | IPC | For a field of doctoral studies the ratio between the number of doctoral students and the number of professors / researchers who supervise should not exceed 3:1. | Positive evaluation | |
| B.3.1.1. | IPC | For the evaluated field, at least one article or another relevant contribution per doctoral student who has obtained the doctoral degree in the last 5 years is made available to the evaluation committee. From this list, the members of the evaluation commission select for analysis, randomly, 5 such relevant articles / contributions per field of doctoral studies. Articles, thus selected and analyzed, will receive a rating on the original contribution to the development of the field, on a scale of 1 to 5. At least three articles must reach the threshold of 3. | Positive evaluation | |
| B.3.1.2. | * | The ratio between the number of presentations of doctoral students who completed their doctoral studies in the evaluated period (last 5 years), including posters, exhibitions, made at prestigious international events (held in the country or abroad) and the number of doctoral students who have completed their doctoral studies in the evaluated period (last five years) is at least equal to 1. | Positive evaluation | |
| B.3.2.1. | * | The number of doctoral theses assigned to a particular referent from a higher education institution, other than the evaluated IOSUD, must not exceed two (2) for theses coordinated by the same doctoral supervisor, in a year. | Positive evaluation | |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| B.3.2.2. | * | The ratio between the number of doctoral theses assigned to a certain scientific referent from another higher education institution than the one in which the doctoral thesis is organized and the number of doctoral theses defended in the same doctoral field within the doctoral school must not be higher than 0.3, compared to the situation recorded in the last five years. Only those doctoral fields in which at least ten doctoral theses have been defended in the last five years are analyzed. | Positive evaluation | |
| C.1.1.1. | | The School for Doctoral Studies in which the field of doctoral studies falls proves the constant development of the process of evaluation and internal quality assurance in accordance with a procedure developed and applied at IOSUD level, among the evaluated criteria being mandatory:<br><br>(a) the scientific activity of doctoral supervisors;<br><br>(b) the infrastructure and logistics necessary to carry out the research activity;<br><br>(c) the procedures and subsequent norms on the basis of which the doctoral studies are organized;<br><br>(d) the scientific activity of the doctoral students;<br><br>(e) training program based on advanced university studies of the doctoral students. | Positive evaluation | |
| C.1.1.2. | * | During the doctoral training, feedback mechanisms from the | Positive evaluation | |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | doctoral students are implemented by which their needs are identified, as well as their general level of satisfaction towards the doctoral program, in order to continuously improve the academic and administrative processes. | | |
| C.2.1.1. | | IOSUD, publishes on the organising institution's website, in compliance with the general regulations of data protection, information such as:<br>a) school for doctoral studies regulation;<br>b) admission regulation;<br>c) doctoral studies contract;<br>d) the regulation for completing studies which also includes the procedure for publicly presentating the thesis;<br>e) the study programs' content;<br>f) the scientific profile and thematic areas/ research topics of the doctoral supervisors in the field, as well as their institutional contact details;<br>g) the list of doctoral students in the field with basic information (year of enrollment, doctoral supervisor);<br>h) information regarding the drafting standards of the doctoral thesis;<br>i) links to abstracts of the doctoral theses to be publicly presented as well as the date, time and place where they will be presented, at least 20 days prior the presentation. | Positive evaluation | |
| C.2.2.1. | | All doctoral students are granted free access to a platform with academic databases relevant to the fields of organized doctoral | Positive evaluation | |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | studies. | | |
| C.2.2.2. | | Each doctoral student is granted access, upon request, to an electronic system for verifying the degree of similarity with other existing scientific or artistic creations. | Positive evaluation | |
| C.2.2.3. | | All doctoral students are granted access to scientific research laboratories or other facilities depending on the specific of the field / fields within the school for doctoral studies, according to internal regulations. | Positive evaluation | |
| C.3.1.1. | * | IOSUD, for each doctoral school, has concluded mobility agreements with foreign universities, with companies that carry out activities in the studied field, which focus on the mobility of doctoral students and professors (for instance, ERASMUS agreements for the doctoral studies cycle). At least 35% of doctoral students have carried out an internship abroad or other form of mobility, such as participating in international scientific conferences. IOSUD develops and implements policies and action plans aimed at increasing the number of doctoral students participating in training courses abroad, up to at least 20%, which is the target at the level of the European Higher Education Area. | Partially positive evaluation | To increase the number of incoming and outcoming Erasmus students' mobility. |
| C.3.1.2. | | IOSUD supports, including financially, the organization of doctorates in international co-supervision, respectively the invitation of recognized experts to give courses / lectures for PhD students. | Positive evaluation | |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| C.3.1.3. | | The internationalization of the activities within the doctoral studies is supported by concrete measures (for instance, participating at educational fairs to attract international doctoral students; including international experts in supervising or presenting committees for doctoral theses, etc.). | Positive evaluation | |

## VI. Conclusions and general recommendations

### Conclusions

The existence and adequate functioning at university level of the management structures (Senate, Senate Commissions, Ethics Commission), as well as of the Council for Doctoral Studies - CSUD (IOSUD-UNITBV management forum) and respectively the Council of the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School.

The existence of laboratories and modern research infrastructure at the UNITBV scientific research centres, mainly placed within the Research-Development Institute (ICDT).

Access to software packages for research within the Centres of the University's Research and Development Institute (ICDT) and to various software resources through the Microsoft Imagine programme.

The existence of IT infrastructure and online platforms (intranet, e-learning).

All doctoral students have access to the facilities, resources and laboratories necessary for the educational and research process.

The official website of the doctoral school provides full and detailed information of candidate students, doctoral students and employers.

The doctoral students are encouraged to participate in scientific conferences, congresses in the country and abroad, workshops and project activities and to publish their scientific articles and reports in national and international scientific journals and proceedings.

**Based on the assessments made on the individual criteria and performance indicators, the following recommendations can be provided:**

- internationalization of the doctoral studies activity and stimulating the doctoral students' participation in the Erasmus students' mobility;
- motivating PhD students by involving them in research teams associated with the topics addressed in their doctoral theses.